

Hilchot Shabbat: Hatmana Part 2

Based on a Naaleh.com shiur by Rabbi Shimon Isaacson
Summary by Devora Kaye

There are three parts to a *blech*. Spot #1 is situated parallel to the fire. Spot #2 is close enough to the fire so that the food reaches *yad soledet bo*. Spot #3 is far enough so that the food never reaches *yad soledet bo*. A pot on spot #3 can't be moved to spot #2 on Shabbat because you need to satisfy the conditions of *chazara* and the pot was not initially close to the fire. A pot on spot #2 may be moved to spot #1 and visa versa. However, if you slide the pot to spot #3 and then you want to slide it back to spot #2 or #1, the conditions of *chazara* would need to be satisfied.

Hatmana is an *issur d'rabanun*. The basis for this is a Gemara in Shabbat. Rava asks, why was there a *gezera* of *hatmana*? He gives a cryptic answer- one might come to do *hatmana* with *remez*. There are two *gezeirot* linked to *hatmana*. The first *gezera* is that one may not wrap a dish or pot with something that doesn't add heat, but only maintains heat, on Shabbat because one might come to boil it up. This is a *machloket* between Rashi and the Rambam. Rashi says one might come to bishul. One might try to insulate the pot, then realize that it's not hot enough, and reheat it and, "Yesh bishul acher bishul b'davar lach." There's an *issur* of reheating liquids. The Rambam says, "Ein bishul acher bishul b'davar lach." There's no *issur* to reheat liquids. But one might come to light a fire. If you do *hatmana* with coal which adds heat,

one might come to stoke the coals. So, there are two *gezeirot* here. One is on Shabbat itself, *hatmana b'davar sheino mosef hevel* (wrapping with something that doesn't add heat) and a second *gezera* on erev Shabbat of *hatmana b'davar she'mosef hevel* (wrapping with something that adds heat).

Hatmana on Shabbat *b'davar sheino mosef hevel* means that if you have pot off the fire and you want to wrap it in towel to retain the heat, it would be prohibited. This is true says the Shulchan Aruch, even if the food is fully cooked. Wrapping the pot in something that is *mosef hevel* would be *ossur* even before Shabbat. The Shulchan Aruch identifies things that are *mosef hevel*- salt, manure, pesolet (inedible parts) of olives. How does this apply today? The *halacha* tells us to look at the system. Is it a *mosef hevel* system where there's new heat coming in? If so, then it's *mosef hevel*. If you take a quilt cover and put it over a metal water urn, that raises a serious question of *hatmana*. The quilt cover doesn't add heat, but the system is in heat generating mode. Insulating within that system would be *ossur* even erev Shabbat. You could however do *hatmana* with something that preserves heat (*maamid hevel*) but doesn't add heat on erev Shabbat. For example, you can wrap something up in a towel. The walls of the vessel and the lid is not considered insulation, it's taking something besides the vessel itself and wrapping it around it.

The Shulchan Aruch tells us that any kind of re-insulation is permitted. If a pot was insulated in a permitted way with a *davar sheino mosef hevel* before Shabbat. And after serving, you want to re-insulate it, you can. Moreover, you can also add insulation. When *chazal* prohibited insulation, they prohibited the first insulation not re-insulation or adding more insulation. There's no *issur* of insulation with a *keli sheini* and therefore using a thermos on Shabbat would be permitted. How much insulation is considered *hatmana*? The Shulchan Aruch says, submerging a pot in coals so that the bottom of the pot touches the coals is *ossur* erev Shabbat because of the *issur* of *hatmana b'davar hamosef hevel*. The Rema adds if the pot sits on the coals but it's open on top it isn't *hatmana* as the pot must be completely wrapped. The Mishna Berura concurs.

There's a major discussion about how much must be left open. The Mishna Berura quotes the Chaye Adam that if the sides of the pot are covered with sand which is heated by the sun that is a *davar hamosef hevel* and the top is covered by something that is not *mosef hevel* it would be prohibited lest one come to insulate the pot entirely. It seems like if most of the pot is covered it would be *ossur*. The Pri Megadim says that if just the top is revealed, it would still be *hatmana* and would be prohibited.

The Mitzvah of Tochacha Part 2

Based on a Naaleh.com shiur by Rabbi Michael Taubes
Summary by Devora Kaye

The Gemara in Beitza discusses the *chiyuv d'oraysa* of tosefet Yom Kippur – accepting Yom Kippur early. There were women who did not keep this *mitzva* and nobody objected. The Gemara asks why and it answers, "Better they should do it unintentionally, than intentionally." The Rambam points out that we see from here that sometimes it's better to be quiet, rather than to offer rebuke. Perhaps we can learn another approach here to answer the question raised previously. When the Gemara in Yevamos says to be quiet, it refers to a person who is sinning *b'shogeg* (unintentionally). Don't say anything, otherwise it will make matters worse. When

he's sinning *b'meizid* (intentionally), then the Gemara in Erchin says, keep trying to correct him until he's ready to hit you. In a contemporary situation, where most Jews are sinning *b'shogeg* perhaps it might be better to keep quiet. But if you know the person is sinning *b'meizid*, then you have to stand up and say something. In a responsa, the Avnei Nezer writes that when it comes to a *shogeg* there's no *mitzva* of *tochacha*, better to be quiet. But the *mitzvat asei* of *tochacha* applies even if the person won't listen. One must rebuke him till he's ready to hit you. The Avnei Nezer continues, you shouldn't give up on a person even if he's a *shogeg*. Maybe it's better not to

make him a *meizid*, but you can still be inviting and try to win him over with positive words and good will.

The Nimukei Yosef differentiates between offering reproof to one person or to a group. If you're talking to one person, try and keep going. If you're reproofing a group and you see they're not ready to listen, drop it. The Ran and the Rema point out that if the *issur* is clearly stated in the Torah, one is obligated to rebuke the sinner as it cannot be that he's sinning *b'shogeg*.

The Mishna Berura quotes the Sefer Chasidim

Continues on page 2

The Mitzvah of Tochacha Part 2

Based on a Naaleh.com shiur by Rabbi Michael Taubes
Summary by Devora Kaye
Continued from page 1

that to effectively give *mussar* it has to be done in a way that the person will take it the right way. The Emes l'Yaakov quotes the exchange between Yaakov and the shepherds in Parshat Vayetzei. There the *Torah* tells us how Yaakov arrived in Charan and saw a group of shepherds gathered at the well. He asks them, "My brothers where are you from?" He continues speaking in a friendly way and then he tells them, "It's in middle of

the afternoon, the day is still long, and if you're being paid by the day, you haven't done a day's work." How is he giving them rebuke when he just met them? He establishes a relationship from the outset. He calls them- my brothers. If it was your brother doing something detrimental, of course you'd say something. Yaakov teaches us, first establish a relationship of friendship, then you can get offer reproof. It's about how you say it.

The *mitzvah* of *tochacha* is something we can all fulfill. Each situation must be weighed carefully. The key to be successful is to establish a relationship. The better the rapport, the more you can accomplish. And as the Avnei Nezer says, never give up even on the worst person. You never know, something might click and you might touch a responsive chord.

Travelling Through Life Accompanied by Tehillim Part 10 Part 3

Based on a Naaleh.com shiur by Rebbetzin Leah Kohn
Summary by Devora Kaye

Rav Hirsh points out that although Yerushalayim was destroyed, it's only the external shell that is now gone. On foreign soil, the Jewish people remained mute and their violins quiet, testimony to the fact that the spirit and sanctity of Yerushalayim is still alive in their heart. In contrast, at a time when Bavel was at its fullest strength, hundreds of years before its destruction, David Hamelech called them *sheduda*- violated. They had no future. The destruction of Yerushalayim was the last great meaningful action of Bavel. They had already conquered vast tracts of land and were considered a world power, as Hashem never gives over the Jewish people to a lowly nation. Destroying the *Bet Hamikdash* was Nevuchadnezzar's last act of glory. After that, *Parat U'madai* conquered Bavel and repaid them for what they did. Nobody mourns or remembers them today. In contrast, the Jews,

even on foreign soil, remember Yerushalayim at the peak of every happy occasion. Anyone who attempts to destroy Yerushalayim is a temporary reality. The day when Edom will be destroyed will come too. Yerushalayim is not just sticks and stones. It's a relationship with Hashem and although we were expelled from *Eretz Yisrael*, Hashem went with us. Exile brings us to strengthen our bond with Hashem stage by stage until we will merit to be redeemed and rebuild the *Bet Hamikdash*.

Why is this chapter said before *birchat hamazon*? The Malbim points us to the first verse, "On the banks of the river of Babylon, there we sat and also cried when we remembered Zion. What does 'there' and 'also' teach us? Life in Bavel was good, physically speaking. Bavel asked us to sing an ode of gratitude for their having enabled us to achieve

material success. The Malbim explains, as Jews, we don't idolize physicality. Our songs are dedicated to Zion. After finishing a nourishing meal, we emphasize that "Not on bread alone does man live but on the word of Hashem." We need food to gather strength to serve Hashem and that is the end goal we focus on. Another reason why we recite this chapter before bentching is that when we sit together at a meal and there is no *divrei Torah*, it's as if we've eaten from offerings to foreign idols. If there's *divrei Torah* it's as if we were invited to the house of Hashem. Reciting a chapter of *Tehilim*, fulfills that requirement.

If Yerushalayim is alive in our hearts it means we are connected to Hashem. May that faith help us merit the redemption and the rebuilding of the *Bet Hamikdash* speedily in our days.